

FACULTY COUNCIL
SCHULICH SCHOOL OF BUSINESS
NOTICE OF MEETING

A meeting of Faculty Council for the 2005/06 Academic Year will be held on Friday,
May 26, 2006 at 11:30 a.m. in Room SSB W132

1. Chairperson's Remarks
2. Dean's Remarks
3. Business Arising from Minutes of Previous Meeting
4. Minutes of Previous Meeting
April 21, 2006 (*Pages 1-5*)
5. Enquiries & Communications
Senate Synopsis- April 27, 2006 (*Page 6-7*)
6. PHD/GBC/UBC Initiatives
7. Ph.D. Committee (*Pages 8 -55*)
Motion #1: Form 3: Other Curriculum Changes
(DCAD 7200, DCAD 7300, DCAD 7500) (*Pages 9-12*)
Motion #2: Form 3: Other Curriculum Changes
(MKTG 7970, MKTG 7971, MKTG 7972, MKTG 7973) (*Pages 13-55*)
8. IMBA Committee (*Pages 56-81*)
Motion: Form 3: Other Curriculum Changes (INTL 6300.03)
9. Nominating Committee (*Available at meeting*)
Committee Slate for 2006/07
10. Committee of the Whole (*Pages 82-83*)
Promotion to the Rank of Professor: Proposed Criteria
11. Other Business (*Pages 84-*)
 - 1) Motion: Spring potential Graduand List (*Pages 84-97*)
 - 3) Motion: Faculty Council Powers (*Page 98*)
 - 4) For Information: Faculty Council Dates 2006-2007 (*Page 99*)
 - 5) For Information: Committee Year End Reports (*Pages 100-106*)
12. Adjournment

**Note: Send regrets to Susan Harrison sharrison@schulich.yorku.ca or call Ext. 55097
Beverages will be available at 11:20 outside SSB W132.**

Schulich School of Business
Minutes of Faculty Council

A regular meeting of Faculty Council for the 2005-2006 academic year was held on Friday, May 26, 2006 at 11:30 a.m. in Room SSB W132.

In Attendance: J. McKellar Chair
 S. Harrison Recording Secretary

Voting Members of Faculty Council Present:

C. Bell	S. Li	D. Horvath	C. Bouquet
C. Curtis	O. Branzei	M. Kipping	M. Kamstra
B. Eberlein	F. Zandi	M. Wade	D. Dimick
E. Maynes	B. Wolf	A. Joshi	M. Cao
H. Rosin	I. Holzinger	R. Karambayya	T. Peridis
W. Cook	A. Richardson	M. Biehl	R. Peterson
K. Main	A. Echeverry (GBC)	Y. Deutsch	E. Fischer
M. Kristal	W. Cragg	D. Zwick	J. Darroch
P. Bradshaw	M. Milevsky	C. Fredette – Ph.D.	M. Giesler

Voting Members of Faculty Council Absent:

M. Dong	F. Gorbet	J. Bogdan -UBC	D. Wheeler
D. Nandy	F. Lazar	J. Dermer	O. Dimitrov
A.J. Sirsi	H.T.Wilson	J. Smithin	T. Wesson
S. Massoud – UBC	R. McClean	H. Wang - GBC	A. Barnes -GBC
A. Mawani	D. Nevo	J. Tan	R. Kozinets
J. Chung	P. Sadorsky	R. Lucas	S. Marchesano - UBC
P. Shum	H. Kim	C. McMillan	G. Morgan
L. Thome	R. Singh -GBC	J. Filippelli - UBC	W. Sheremata
R. Heeler	A. deCarufel	D. Thomassin	V. Trivedi
A. Dubreuil -GBC	J. Kim - GBC	I. Henriques M. Rice	I. Fenwick
V. Foutsis -GBC	J. Kumar - GBC	C. Graham	E. Auster
D. Johnston	M. Farjoun	S. Weiss	S. Yeomans
M. Szaki	K. Bewley	M. Annisette	

Regrets, Leaves, Sabbaticals:

A. Campbell	B. Zimmerman	R. Irving	E. Prisman
L. Wright	A. Bhanich-Supapol	T. Keil	I. Macdonald
G. Roberts	A. Madhok	Y. Tian	S. Bonus
P. Aulakh	T. Beechy	Y. Pan	E. Watson
N. Naumoff	C. Oliver	C. Chelariu	J. Zemans
B. Gainer			

Non-Voting Members of Faculty Council Present:

N. Sutherland	P. Shanks	J. Parna	S. Siddik
S. Sinclair			

Non-Voting Members of Faculty Council Absent:

R. Alleyne	M. Bhutani	T. D'Agostino	E. Gutmacher
J. Joustra	N. Kohli	A. Makooie	R. Mayer
S. Firth	P. Persaud	J. Palumbo	R. Panopoulos
P. Shea	C. Partland	C. Pattenden	S. Sarik
S. Tenn	C. Shewell	B. Schulz	K. Larson
C. Ward	T. Tolia	A. Middleton	
A. Gampel			

Item #1 Chairperson's Remarks

Chairman J. McKellar welcomed everyone to today's meeting. Regarding the committee of the whole discussion of April 21, 2006, Prof. McKellar invited members to send any additional comments, or omissions to the recording secretary, and noted the Executive Committee will be following up with the comments and suggestions from the Committee of whole discussion. Documentation on three additional agenda items has been distributed today. Prof. McKellar introduced Professor W. Cragg. Professor Cragg explained that today is the 10th anniversary annual meeting of Transparency International. After giving a brief history of the inception of this chapter with the Schulich School of Business, Prof. Cragg, who is retiring this year as Chair, presented Dean Horvath and the Schulich School of Business with a certification of thank you. Dean Horvath accepted with thanks and noted we would like to continue to work with Transparency International.

Item #2 Dean's Remarks

Dean Horvath noted that we have come to the end of another academic year and remarked that everyone should be pleased with our achievements. We are celebrating the largest number of graduates and next year we expect even larger numbers. The Dean thanked everyone, including the UBC, GBC, Ph.D. students and the student clubs, for their commitment, time and efforts.

Recruiting: Dean Horvath indicated recruiting has finished for this year with seven new members joining Schulich. Russell Belk, MKTG; Andrew Crane, Business Ethics; Sylvia Hsu, ACTG; Dirk Matten Chair, Corporate Social Responsibility and Professor of PLCY; Mark Pagell, OMIS; Sandy Qu, ACTG; and Joni Young, ACTG. Operating Committee is already planning for recruitment for next year with possible eight new positions which will include 4 chairs.

Program Appraisals: The Undergraduate Program Review has been received and Dean Horvath announced we received an excellent appraisal. The OCGS review is almost complete with some minor administrative items to address. Dean Horvath thanked both Professors David Dimick and Tom Beechy for all of their efforts in preparing the material for the reviews.

Dean Horvath reported that the Ontario government is focusing on regulating tuitions. First year tuition will increase by eight percent and after year one it will increase by four percent. The Dean has a further meeting with the Minister of Ontario Colleges and Universities on June 13th with regards to graduate fees.

The Schulich School of Business Fortieth anniversary plans are continuing. A logo marking this occasion has been decided on and will be available soon.

Schulich in the Media:

- On May 1st Korean media station MBN profiled the Schulich School of Business. Our school was one of ten schools in the world that were visited by MBN. Thanks to Charmaine Courtis' office who organized this visit.
- The May issue of *Innovations*, a new major Chinese business magazine, showcased Schulich, one of only two schools featured. Dean Horvath's office has a copy of the magazine if you would like to peruse it.
- Our building has been named one of the 2006 recipients of the Governor General's Medal in Architecture.

Incoming student applications for Fall 2006 are going well. Undergrad numbers will be the same, MBA and IMBA numbers are on the rise, with a large interest in the part-time program. EMBA numbers are also very encouraging. Ph.D. numbers are a little higher for this fall and the quality of students is very good.

Upcoming events:

Convocation – June 16, 2006: Please join us in the celebration. The Honorary Degree will be presented to Dominic D'Alessandro.

Congress 2006 begins today throughout York University campus. It has not been held here in 20 years.

Item #3 Business Arising from Minutes of Previous Meeting

Suggestions regarding the Role and Function of the SSB Faculty Council will be referred to the Executive Committee in the Fall.

Item #4 Minutes of Previous Meeting

Professor B. Wolf moved the acceptance of the Minutes of Faculty Council Meeting of April 21, 2006
Seconded by Professor A. Joshi. Motion Carried.

Item #5 Enquiries and Communications

The Senate Synopsis of April 27, 2006 was received for information.

Item #6 UBC/GBC/PhD Initiatives

PH.D. – Chris Fredette, Faculty Council representative, thanked the Dean for hosting an evening information session, and also thanked Professor C. Oliver for her work this year as the Director of the Ph.D. Program. Student accomplishments include David Weitzner's recent dissertation defence and upcoming graduation. Unfortunately, the annual softball game scheduled for today, has to be postponed due to rain.

GBC – Antonio Echeverry, GBC President, reported their team building get-away is scheduled for June 3, 2006, and that they are currently in the process of recruiting volunteers for the Olympia Get-away. They will be hosting a National case competition with the top schools in Canada on November 18th with the help of both Joseph Palumbo and Prof. Ashwin Joshi. Overall they are looking forward to the upcoming year.

UBC – There was no representative from the UBC present.

Item #7 Ph.D. Committee

Professor D. Dimick, on behalf of the Ph.D. Committee, moved that Faculty Council approve Form 3: Other Curriculum Changes affecting DCAD 7200, 7300 and 7500, changes in the name and numbering. Seconded by Professor C. Bell.

Professor Dimick explained that these changes are basically a reorganization of content of the DCAD courses. A brief question period took place involving Ph.D. student Chris Fredette. In conclusion, Chairman Mckellar suggested that if Mr. Fredette required further clarification, he should contact Christine Oliver, Director of Ph.D. program.

Motion Carried.

Professor D. Dimick, on behalf of the Ph.D. Committee, moved that Faculty Council approve Form 3: Other Curriculum Changes affecting MKTG 7970, 7971, 7972, 7973. Seconded by Professor J. Darroch. Professor Dimick noted that the library statements had been distributed today for review and information. Motion Carried.

Item #8 IMBA Committee

Professor H. Rosin, on behalf of the IMBA Committee, moved that Faculty Council approve Form 3: Other Curriculum Changes affecting INTL 6300.03. Seconded by Professor B. Wolf.

Professor Rosin explained the IMBA committee is recommending splitting the existing INTL 6300.03 – Operating in a Networked Environment to two 1.5 credit courses which basically will contain the same course content.

Charmaine Courtis recommended an amendment to the course numbering to 5301.015 as it will be taken in the first year, and not 6301.015 as currently indicated. The amendment was accepted.

Professor E. Maynes questioned the requirements if these courses are core courses. Professor Wolf will go back and look at the legislation and will bring forward any changes to improve the consistency.

Motion Carried with amendment.

Item #9 Nominating Committee

Professor T. Peridis, on behalf of Nominating Committee, moved that Faculty Council approve the committee slate for July 1, 2006 to June 2007. Seconded by Professor B. Wolf.

Professor P. Bradshaw enquired how the committee incorporates and develops the needs and integration of new junior faculty on committees. Professor Peridis explained that they try to put junior faculty on committees so that in the future they will have the required experience to chair various committees. He also noted that for new faculty the first three years they join us, they are to focus on research and therefore, not too much committee work is assigned. Professor Bradshaw also enquired if a review of

the committee mandates will be forthcoming. Both Prof. Peridis and Prof. McKellar indicated that this work will continue this year.

Motion Carried.

Professor Peridis suggested we deal with item #11 Other Business before beginning the Committee of the Whole discussion.

Item #11 Other Business

1) Charmaine Courtis, Executive Director, Student Services & International Relations, moved that Faculty Council accept the Spring 2006 Graduation list. She noted that we have one Ph.D. student receiving his degree. Seconded by Professor T. Peridis. Motion Carried.

2) Prof. R. Peterson moved that Faculty Council move to Summer powers until the first regular meeting of Faculty Council in October 2006. Seconded by Prof. B. Wolf.

Motion Carried.

3) Prof. McKellar asked members to take note of the scheduled Faculty Council Dates for 2006/07.

4) Committee Reports are for information. Professor Bradshaw noted that some final reports had not been submitted.

Professor D. Dimick reminded everyone that Congress 2006 will be taking place on York campus from May 27 – June 3, 2006. Also the new regime of reporting of grades will begin with the Summer 2006 term. If you have questions please contact either David Dimick or Ali Makool.

Item #10 Committee of the Whole

Promotion to the Rank of Professor: Proposed Criteria

Professor P. Bradshaw moved the meeting to Committee of the Whole with Professor Rein Peterson acting as chairman. Seconded by Professor D. Dimick.

Motion Carried.

Professor Peterson explained that there would be 30 minute time limit to the discussion with the option of increasing the time if required. Professor W. Cook gave a brief background on the proposed criteria noting the President's office has recommended all faculties should be preparing criteria for promotion. In preparing this draft document, Professor Cook indicated he had consulted with various colleagues, and looked at other universities on the promotion to professor criteria. He noted other schools were very vague on criteria with emphasis placed on research and teaching. What we currently have in place has been the practice for approximately 15 years. He explained that after this discussion, based on comments and suggestions, Prof. Cook will make revisions and bring the end document back to faculty council as a motion for approval.

Points for consideration, and/or of concern:

- Providing an operational definition equating eminence with the level of output so that primary criteria comes through.
- Scope of the achievements that are contemplated in the York policy are very broad, leading us to narrow that down in our criteria.
- Referee letters, are 'never' negative, 'always' glowing. (Cause: candidate sees full letter, not just a gist. Result: we are putting less emphasis on these).
- Point B – "leading" journals vs. "specialized" journals, may need to look at this wording.
- There is nothing in our criteria about giving credit for fostering the discipline in an organizational kind of way. (E.g., if you served as a president of a professional organization, this is important and should not be ignored. Creative type of service at the university and beyond, should be recognized.)
- One's "field of interest" needs to be clarified.
- Silo approach by only "excellent research" or by "excellent teaching", versus "good in all three and excel in one".
- Criteria in the Senate document currently does not look at the contribution to specifically a 'business school'.
- Should reflect a celebration of leadership - language too pragmatic and not celebrative enough.
- We are guided by the YUFA criteria and the definition should or have some reference to 'excellence', 'high competence' and 'competence'.

- Standards should be available to help people identify when to go up (for promotion to Professor).
- Strategy of whole citizenship – actively involved in running the organization, doing the teaching, emerged as a full participant – how does this get reflected?
- Very difficult challenge we need to look at the benchmarking of other schools.
- Many elements are key requirements - have to give the committees the flexibility - respect of your own peers, it may not be possible to quantify, identify with our own ambitions.
- If the criteria changes, who does it apply to? (Previously, criteria has focused on service, now we focus on research.) Professor Cook reassured that these are not new criteria, so will not affect any person in particular.
- Emphasis indicates on research is a very strong focus, we need to distinguish delivering materials or contributing to research differences between producing research that gets published in a top journal and producing books and distributing knowledge is important.

Professor Dimick, to sum up this discussion, pointed out that the York policy is as stated as per the original document distributed today and it is not changing. We are trying to articulate in some more detail and communicate to people who might be going up, what they might look at. The notion should be that these become guidelines and not policy, in order to give guidance, but not tie hands.

Professor Joshi and the faculty thanked Prof. Cook for producing this document. Professor Peterson suggested that if any one has further comments or suggestions to email Professor Cook directly.

Professor Dimick made the motion to move out of committee of the whole. Seconded by Professor B. Wolf.

Item #12 Adjournment
The meeting was adjourned.